Fax: (415) 391-3245

A NON-PROFIT CORPORATION 311 California Street, Suite 510 San Francisco, California 94104 www.asyousow.org

May 20, 2004

## NOTICE OF VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA HEALTH & SAFETY CODE §25249.5 ET SEQ.

Dear Public Enforcement Agencies:

As You Sow ("AYS") is a non-profit foundation organized under California's Non-Profit Public Benefit Corporation Law. AYS is dedicated to, among other causes, the protection of the environment, the promotion of human health, the improvement of worker and consumer safety, and environmental education.

AYS has documented violations of California's Safe Drinking Water & Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 ("Proposition 65"), codified at Health & Safety Code §25249.5 et seq. This letter serves to provide AYS' notification of these violations to the public enforcement agencies and to the violator. Pursuant to §25249.7(d) of the statute, AYS intends to bring an enforcement action sixty (60) days after effective service of this notice unless the public enforcement agencies have commenced and are diligently prosecuting an action to rectify these violations.

A summary of the statute and its implementing regulations, which was prepared by the lead agency designated under the statute, is enclosed with the copy of this notice served upon the violator. The specific details of the violations that are the subject of this notice are provided below.

**Alleged violator.** The name of the violator covered by this notice is **WAL-MART STORES**, **INC.** ("Wal-Mart").

**Chemicals.** These violations involve exposures to lead and lead compounds from the products described below. On February 27, 1987, the State of California

Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code §25249.5 *et seq.* May 20, 2004
Page 2

officially listed lead as a chemical known to cause reproductive toxicity (Title 22 California Code of Regulations § 12000, et seq.). On October 1, 1992, the State of California officially listed lead and lead compounds as chemicals known to cause cancer (Title 22 California Code of Regulations § 12000, et seq.)

**Consumer products.** The products that are the subject of this notice are jewelry manufactured, distributed or sold by Wal-Mart including, but not limited to, the products identified in Exhibit A attached hereto.

**Route of exposure.** The consumer exposures that are the subject of this notice result from the handling and/or wearing of these products. Accordingly, the consumer exposures have occurred and continue to occur through the dermal contact and ingestion.

**Duration of violations.** Each of these ongoing violations has occurred on every day since May 20, 2000, and will continue every day until clear and reasonable warnings are provided or until these deleterious chemicals are removed from the products. Under Proposition 65, each exposure constitutes a separate violation. Health & Safety Code §25249.7(b). The maximum civil penalty for each such violation is \$2,500. *Id.* These same facts constitute a violation of Business and Professions Code § 17200 *et seq.* 

Pursuant to Title 11, C.C.R. § 3100, a Certificate of Merit is attached hereto.

In keeping with its public interest mission and to expeditiously rectify these ongoing violations of California law, AYS is interested in seeking a constructive resolution of this matter without engaging in costly and protracted litigation. Please direct all communications regarding this notice to AYS' counsel in this matter:

Babak Naficy, Esq. 1204 Nipoma Street San Luis Obispo, CA 93401 Telephone: (805) 593-0926 Facsimile: (805) 593-0946

### EXHIBIT A (WAL-MART STORES, INC.)



Product ID 7 33399 15796 2



Product ID 7 33399 16368 0

# (for As You Sow's Notice of Proposition 65 Violation on WAL-MART STORES, INC.)

#### I, Lawrence E. Fahn, declare:

- 1. This Certificate of Merit accompanies the attached sixty-day notice in which it is alleged that **WAL-MART STORES**, **INC.** has violated Health & Safety Code §25249.6 by failing to provide clear and reasonable warnings.
  - 2. I am the Executive Director of the noticing party, As You Sow.
- 3. I have consulted with one or more persons with relevant and appropriate experience or expertise who has reviewed facts, studies, or other data regarding the exposure to the listed chemicals that are the subject of the action.
- 4. Based on the information obtained through those consultations, and on all other information in my possession, I believe there is a reasonable and meritorious case for the private action. I understand that "reasonable and meritorious case for the private action" means that the information provides a credible basis that all elements of the plaintiffs' case can be established and that the information did not prove that the alleged violator will be able to establish any of the affirmative defenses set forth in the statute.
- 5. The copy of this Certificate of Merit served on the Attorney General attaches to it factual information sufficient to establish the basis for this certificate, including the information identified in Health and Safety Code §25249.7(h)(2), i.e., (1) the identity of the persons consulted with and relied on by the certifier, and (2) the facts, studies, or other data reviewed by those persons.

	-//
Dated:	5/19/07

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, the undersigned, declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the following is true and correct:

I am a citizen of the United States, over the age of 18 years, and not a party to the within action; my business address is: 311 California Street, Suite 510, San Francisco, California 94104.

On May 20, 2004, I served the following documents:

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit
- "The Safe Drinking Water and Toxic Enforcement Act of 1986 (Proposition 65): A Summary"

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

H. Lee Scott, Jr., CEO Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. 702 SW 8<sup>th</sup> Street Bentonville, AR 72716

On May 20, 2004, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit, including Supporting Documentation Required by Title 11, C.C.R. § 3102

on the following party by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to the party listed below, and depositing it at a United States Postal Service Office for delivery by Certified Mail:

Attn: Craig Thompson, Deputy Attorney General California Department of Justice P.O. Box 944255 Sacramento, CA 94244-2550

On May 20, 2004, I served the following document(s):

- Notice of Violation of California Health & Safety Code § 25249.5 et seq.
- Certificate of Merit

on each of the parties on the service list attached hereto by placing a true and correct copy thereof in a sealed envelope, addressed to each of the parties on the service list attached hereto, and depositing it at United States Postal Service mail box for delivery by First Class Mail.

Executed on May 20, 2004, at San Francisco, California.

THE HONORABLE THOMAS J ORLOFF ALAMEDA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1225 FALLON ST RM 900 OAKLAND CA. 94612

THE HONORABLE WILLIAM RICHMOND ALPINE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 248 MARKLEFVILLE CA. 96120

THE HONORABLE TODD D RIEBE AMADOR COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 708 COURT ST STE 202 JACKSON CA. 95642

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMSEY BUTTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 25 COUNTY CTR DR OROVILLE CA 95965

THE HONORABLE JEFFREY TUTTLE CALAVERAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 891 MTN RANCH RD SAN ANDREAS CA. 95249

THE HONORABLE JOHN POYNER
COLUSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
547 MARKET ST
COLUSA CA 95932

THE HONORABLE ROBERT KOCHLY CONTRA COSTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 670 MARTINEZ CA. 94553

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RIESE
DEL NORTE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY
450 H ST STE 171
CRESCENT CITY CA 95531

THE HONORABLE GARY L LACY EL DORADO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 515 MAIN ST PLACERVILLE CA 95667

THE HONORABLE ELIZABETH EGAN FRESNO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 2220 TULARE ST STE 1000 FRESNO CA. 93721

THE HONORABLE ROBERT HOLZAPFEL GLENN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 430 WILLOWS CA 95988

THE HONORABLE PAUL GALLEGOS HUMBOLDT COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 825 FIFTH ST EUREKA CA 95501

THE HONORABLE GILBERT OTERO IMPERIAL COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 939 W MAIN ST EL CENTRO CA 92243

THE HONORABLE ARTHUR MAILLET INYO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO DRAWER D INDEPENDENCE CA. 93526

THE HONORABLE EDWARD R JAGELS KERN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1215 TRUXTUN AVE BAKERSFIELD CA 93301

THE HONORABLE RON CALHOUN KINGS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1400 W LACEY BLVD HANFORD CA 93230

THE HONORABLE GERHARD LUCK LAKE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 255 N FORBES ST LAKEPORT CA 95453

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BURNS LASSEN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 220 S LASSEN ST STE 8 SUSANVILLE CA 96130

THE HONORABLE STEVE COOLEY L A COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 210 W TEMPLE ST STE 18000 LOS ANGELES CA 90012-3210

THE HONORABLE ERNEST LICALSI MADERA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 209 W YOSEMITE AVE MADERA CA 93637

THE HONORABLE PAULA FRESCHI KAMENA MARIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 3501 CIVIC CTR DR RM 130 SAN RAFAEL CA 94903

THE HONORABLE ROBERT BROWN MARIPOSA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 730 MARIPOSA CA 95338

THE HONORABLE NORMAN VROMAN MENDOCINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 1000 UKIAH CA 95482

THE HONORABLE GORDON SPENCER MERCED COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 2222 M ST MERCED CA 95340

THE HONORABLE JORDAN FUNK MODOC COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 204 S COURT ST RM 202 ALTURAS CA 96101-4020

THE HONORABLE GEORGE BOOTH MONO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 617 BRIDGEPORT CA 93517 THE HONORABLE DEAN FLIPPO MONTEREY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNE' PO BOX 1131 SALINAS CA 93902

THE HONORABLE GARY LIEBERSTEIN NAPA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 931 PARKWAY MALL NAPA CA 94559

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL FERGUSON NEVADA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 201 CHURCH ST STE 8 NEVADA CITY CA 95959

THE HONORABLE TONY RACKAUCKAS ORANGE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 401 CIVIC CTR DR WEST SANTA ANA CA 92701

THE HONORABLE BRAD FENOCCHIO PLACER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 11562 B AVE AUBURN CA 95603

THE HONORABLE JEFF CUNAN PLUMAS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 520 MAIN ST RM 404 QUINCY CA 95971

THE HONORABLE GROVER C TRASK II RIVERSIDE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 4075 MAIN ST RIVERSIDE CA 92501

THE HONORABLE JAN SCULLY SACRAMENTO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 901 G ST SACRAMENTO CA 95814

THE HONORABLE JOHN SARSFIELD SAN BENITO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 419 FOURTH ST, FL 2 HOLLISTER CA 95023

THE HONORABLE MICHAEL RAMOS SAN BERNARDINO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 316 N MTN VIEW AVE SAN BERNARDINO CA 92415-0004

THE HONORABLE BONNIE DUMANIS SAN DIEGO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNES 330 W BROADWAY STE 1320 SAN DIEGO CA 92101

THE HONORABLE KAMALA HARRIS SAN FRANCISCO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 880 BRYANT ST RM 325 SAN FRANCISCO CA 94103

THE HONORABLE JOHN D PHILLIPS SAN JOAQUIN COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 990 STOCKTON CA 95201-0990

#### PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AGENCIES SERVICE LIST (updated 03/25/04)

THE HONORABLE GERALD T SHEA SAN LUIS OBISPO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY SOLANO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1050 MONTEREY ST RM 450 SAN LUIS OBISPO CA 93408

THE HONORABLE JAMES P FOX SAN MATEO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 400 COUNTY CTR FL 3 REDWOOD CITY CA 94063

THE HONORABLE THOMAS W SNEDDON JR SANTA BARBARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY STANISLAUS COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1105 SANTA BARBARA ST SANTA BARBARA CA 93101

THE HONORABLE GEORGE KENNEDY SANTA CLARA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 70 W HEDDING ST WEST WING SAN JOSE CA 95110

THE HONORABLE BOB LEE SANTA CRUZ COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 701 OCEAN ST RM 200 SANTA CRUZ CA 95060

THE HONORABLE GERALD C. BENITO SHASTA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 1525 COURT ST FL 3 REDDING CA 96001

THE HONORABLE LAWRENCE ALLEN SIERRA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 457 DOWNIEVILLE CA 95936

THE HONORABLE PETER F KNOLL SISKIYOU COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 986 YREKA CA 96097

THE HONORABLE DAVID W PAULSON 600 UNION AVE FAIRFIELD CA 94533

THE HONORABLE STEPHEN PASSALACQUA SONOMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 600 ADMINISTRATION DR RM 212-J SANTA ROSA CA 95403

THE HONORABLE JAMES C BRAZELTON PO BOX 442 MODESTO CA 95353

THE HONORABLE CARL V ADAMS SUTTER COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 446 SECOND ST YUBA CITY CA 95991

THE HONORABLE GREGG COHEN TEHAMA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 519 RED BLUFF CA 96080

THE HONORABLE DAVID L CROSS TRINITY COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY PO BOX 310 WEAVERVILLE CA 96093

THE HONORABLE PHILLIP J CLINE TULARE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 221 S MOONEY AVE RM 224 VISALIA CA 93291

THE HONORABLE DONALD I SEGERSTROM TUOLUMNE COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 2 SOUTH GREEN ST SONORA CA 95370

THE HONORABLE GREG TOTTEN VENTURA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 800 S VICTORIA AVE VENTURA CA 93009

THE HONORABLE DAVID C HENDERSON YOLO COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 301 SECOND ST WOODLAND CA 95695

THE HONORABLE PATRICK MCGRATH YUBA COUNTY DISTRICT ATTORNEY 215 FIFTH ST MARYSVILLE CA 95901

LOS ANGELES CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 800 CITY HALL EAST 200 N MAIN ST LOS ANGELES CA 90012

SAN DIEGO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE CIVIC CENTER PLAZA 1200 THIRD AVE STE 1620 SAN DIEGO CA 92101

SAN JOSE CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE 151 W MISSION ST SAN JOSE CA 95110

SAN FRANCISCO CITY ATTORNEY'S OFFICE CITY HALL RM 234 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102